

Minute nº2

Reference: CCMAR/IAAMP/11/2024

Assistant Researcher – Development and Management of Marine Protected Areas (M/F)

On the 10th of January two thousand twenty-five, at 11:00 hours, was held online the second meeting of the selection panel nominated by the CCMAR Board of Directors on 29/11/2024 for the position CCMAR/IAAMP/11/2024 under the MarPlus Project - Hiring of Highly Qualified Human Resources, funded by the Algarve 2030 program and cofinanced by the European Union. The agenda of this meeting was 1) to admit or exclude candidates based on the documents submitted and 2) to evaluate and rank the candidates.

The following members of the selection panel were present:

- 1 - Adelino Vicente Mendonça Canário, President of the CCMAR Board of Directors and Full Professor at the University of Algarve (President);.....
- 2 – Karim Erzini, Professor at the University of Algarve and Researcher at CCMAR (regular member);.....
- 3 – Jorge Manuel dos Santos Gonçalves, CCMAR Board of Directors member, CCMAR Researcher, and Professor at the University of Cadiz (regular member);.....
- 4 – José Paula, Associate Professor with Habilitation at the University of Lisbon and Researcher at MARE (regular member);
- 5 – Helena Maria Gregório Pina Calado, Associate Professor with Habilitation at the University of the Azores -FCT and Researcher at MARE (regular member).

The President started by greeting the panel members and proceeded with the agenda.

- 1) Admission and exclusion of the candidates

The following candidates applied for the position:.....

- Mohammadreza Mirzaei
- Bárbara Bastos Horta e Costa
- Neus Campanyà i Llovet

The three candidates, Mohammadreza Mirzaei, Bárbara Bastos Horta e Costa and Neus Campanyà i Llovet were unanimously admitted on absolute merit

- 2) Evaluation and ranking of the candidates

The meeting proceeded with each panel member presenting their scores and candidate ranking following the criteria in the published call. This was followed by voting of the candidate for each position according to the scores of each panel member, starting with the first, followed by the second until all the candidates had been ordered. For the first place, Bárbara Bastos Horta e Costa received a unanimous vote. For the second place, Neus Campanyà i Llovet received a unanimous vote. Mohammadreza Mirzaei was automatically placed in third place. As a result of the voting, the ranking is as follows:

- 1- Bárbara Bastos Horta e Costa
- 2- Neus Campanyà i Llovet.....
- 3- Mohammadreza Mirzaei.....

The documents supporting the scoring of the candidate by the selection panel members are annexed to these minutes and are an integral part of the process.

The selection panel decided to proceed with a preliminary hearing of the candidate subject to this preliminary decision. Under Article 121 of the Administrative Procedure Code, the candidate has 10 working days from the date of notification by email to contest the preliminary decision.

Moreover, the decision will become final without further formalities if the candidate does not raise any objection within the legal period.

There being nothing further to discuss, the meeting was closed, having previously drawn up these minutes, which, after being read, were unanimously approved by the members of the Selection Committee both regarding their content and the decision that they will be signed solely by the President, with the full consent of the committee members.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to be 'A. M. Canário', written in a cursive style.

Adelino V. M. Canário
(President of the Selection Panel)

CANDIDATE			Mohammadreza Mirzaei	Barbara Bastos Horta e Costa	Neus Campanya Llovet	
Parameters	%	Criteria	Evaluation of criterium (0-100 points)	Weighted evaluation	Evaluation of criterium (0-100 points)	Weighted evaluation
Curriculum vitae	0.80	CA) Scientific and technological, cultural or artistic production in the last five years, considered most relevant by the candidate. The content of the scientific output is more relevant than publication metrics or the publishing entity (55%)	40	22.00	100	55.00
		CB) Applied or practice-based research activities developed in the last five years and considered by the candidate to be most impactful (20%)	20	4.00	100	20.00
		CC) Extension and dissemination activities developed in the last five years, particularly in the context of promoting scientific culture and responsible research, considered most relevant by the candidate (1%)	10	0.40	95	3.80
		CD) Management activities of science, technology, and innovation programs, or experience in observing, monitoring, and evaluating the scientific and technological system or higher education in Portugal or abroad (1%)	0	0.00	0	0.00
			Subtotal:	26.40	Subtotal:	78.80
Motivation and Capacity for Innovation	0.20	MA) Coherence in expressing motivations for the position, explaining the relevance of the scientific and curricular path to the position and personal goals;				
		MB) Demonstration of alignment with the goals and values of CCMAR, based on the relevance of the scientific and curricular path.	25	5.00	90	18.00
		MC) Ability to present specific contributions to the development of CCMAR based on the relevance of the scientific and curricular path, career plan, and work plan.				
			Subtotal:	5.00	Subtotal:	18.00
Curricular and motivational evaluation			Total	31.40	Total	96.80
			Subtotal:	31.40	Subtotal:	96.80
			Total	31.40	Total	96.80
			Subtotal:	31.40	Subtotal:	96.80
			Total	31.40	Total	96.80

I placed candidate Bárbara Horta e Costa in first place, considering the scientific quality of the publications, leadership in scientific projects and policy delivery related to marine protected areas and ocean conservation, dissemination, and an excellent motivation letter, including a work plan.

I placed candidate Neus Campanya Llovet in second place because it has a relevant scientific contribution but is clearly inferior to the first candidate.

Data e Assinatura: 10/1/2021 

CANDIDATE			Mohammadreza Mirzaei	Barbara Bastos Horta e Costa	Neus Company Llovet	
Parameters	%	Criteria	Evaluation of criterium (0-100 points)	Weighted evaluation	Evaluation of criterium (0-100 points)	Weighted evaluation
Curriculum vitae	0.80	CA) Scientific and technological, cultural or artistic production in the last five years, considered most relevant by the candidate. The content of the scientific output is more relevant than publication metrics or the publishing entity (55%) CB) Applied or practice-based research activities developed in the last five years and considered by the candidate to be most impactful (20%) CC) Extension and dissemination activities developed in the last five years, particularly in the context of promoting scientific culture and practices, considered most relevant by the candidate (4%) CD) Management activities of science, technology, and innovation programs, or experience in observing, monitoring, and evaluating the scientific and technological system or higher education in Portugal or abroad (1%)	70	38.50	95	52.25
	0.20	MA) Coerência na expressão das motivações para a posição, expondo a relevância do percurso científico e curricular para a posição e objetivos pessoais; MB) Demonstração de alinhamento com os objetivos e valores do CCMAR, tendo por base a relevância do percurso científico e curricular; MC) Capacidade de apresentar contribuições específicas para o desenvolvimento do CCMAR, tendo por base a relevância do percurso científico e curricular, o plano de carreira e o plano de trabalhos	70	14.00	95	19.00
Motivation and Capacity for Innovation	0.20		70	0.70	90	0.90
			Subtotal:	65.20	Subtotal:	75.95
			Subtotal:	14.00	Subtotal:	18.00
Curricular and motivational evaluation			Total	69.20	Total	94.95
			Subtotal:	19.00	Subtotal:	81.90

Data e Assinatura:

Assinado por: **KARIM ERZINI**

Num. de Identificação: 12259423

Data: 2025.01.07 21:27:59+00'00'

MARPLUS -Development of Marine Protected Areas

CANDIDATE		Mohammadreza Mirzaei		Barbara Bastos Horta e Costa		Neus Campany Llovet	
Parameters	%	Criteria	%	Evaluation of criterium (0-100 points)	Weighed evaluation	Evaluation of criterium (0-100 points)	Weighed evaluation
Curriculum vitae	0,80	CA) Scientific and technological, cultural or artistic production in the last five years, considered most relevant by the candidate. The content of the scientific output is more relevant than publication metrics or the publishing entity.(55%) CB) Applied or practice-based research activities developed in the last five years and considered by the candidate to be most impactful (20%). CC) Extension and dissemination activities developed in the last five years, particularly in the context of promoting scientific culture and practices, considered most relevant by the candidate.(4%). CD) Management activities of science, technology, and innovation programs, or experience in observing, monitoring, and evaluating the scientific and technological system or higher education in Portugal or abroad (1%).	0,55	60	33,00	99	54,45
			0,20	60	12,00	95	19,00
			0,04	60	2,40	95	3,80
			0,01	10	0,10	70	0,70
			0,80	Subtotal:	47,50	Subtotal:	67,65
Motivation and Capacity for Innovation	0,20	MA) Coerência na expressão das motivações para a posição, expondo a relevância do percurso científico e curricular para a posição e objetivos pessoais. MB) Demonstração de alinhamento com os objetivos e valores do CCMAR, tendo por base a relevância do percurso científico e curricular. MC) Capacidade de apresentar contribuições específicas para o desenvolvimento do CCMAR, tendo por base a relevância do percurso científico e curricular, o plano de carreira e o plano de trabalhos	0,20	65	13,00	95	19,00
			0,20	Subtotal:	13,00	Subtotal:	18,00
Curricular and motivational evaluation				Total	60,50	Total	85,65
				Subtotal:	19,00	Subtotal:	18,00
				Total	96,95	Total	85,65

The best candidate was Barbara Horta e Costa who excelled in all the evaluation criteria, from scientific production to scientific impact in the area required.
The second position was awarded to Neus Campany Llovet who has high-quality research work on areas related to the subject.
In third position comes M. Reza Mirzaei, who has a relevant experience at international level, even though not focused on the main area of interest.

Data e Assinatura:

10/01/2025



CANDIDATE			Mohammadreza Mirzaei		Barbara Bastos Horta e Costa		Neus Company Llovet	
Parameters	%	Criteria	Evaluation of criterium (0-100 points)	Weighed evaluation	Evaluation of criterium (0-100 points)	Weighed evaluation	Evaluation of criterium (0-100 points)	Weighed evaluation
Curriculum vitae	0.80	CA) Scientific and technological, cultural or artistic production in the last five years, considered most relevant by the candidate. The content of the scientific output is more relevant than publication metrics or the publishing entity (55%)	50	27.50	90	49.50	70	38.50
		CB) Applied or practice-based research activities developed in the last five years and considered by the candidate to be most impactful (20%)	20	4.00	90	18.00	70	14.00
		CC) Extension and dissemination activities developed in the last five years, particularly in the context of promoting scientific culture and practices, considered most relevant by the candidate (4%)	20	0.80	80	3.20	70	2.80
		CD) Management activities of science, technology, and innovation programs, or experience in observing, monitoring, and evaluating the scientific and technological system or higher education in Portugal or abroad (1%)	40	0.40	70	0.70	50	0.50
			Subtotal:	32.70	Subtotal:	71.40	Subtotal:	55.80
Motivation and Capacity for Innovation	0.20	MA) Coerência na expressão das motivações para a posição, expondo a relevância do percurso científico e curricular para a posição e objetivos pessoais;						
		MB) Demonstração de alinhamento com os objetivos e valores do CCMAR, tendo por base a relevância do percurso científico e curricular;	30	6.00	90	18.00	70	14.00
		MC) Capacidade de apresentar contribuições específicas para o desenvolvimento do CCMAR, tendo por base a relevância do percurso científico e curricular, o plano de carreira e o plano de trabalhos						
			Subtotal:	6.00	Subtotal:	18.00	Subtotal:	14.00
Curricular and motivational evaluation			Total	38.70	Total	89.40	Total	69.80

Data e Assinatura:

Assinado por: **JOSÉ PAVÃO MENDES DE PAULA**
 Num. de Identificação: 05197105
 Data: 2025.01.10 11:29:20 +0000

CANDIDATE		Mohammadreza Mirzaei		Barbara Bastos Horta e Costa		Neus Campany Llovet			
Parameters	%	Criteria	%	Evaluation of criterium (0-100 points)	Weighted evaluation	Evaluation of criterium (0-100 points)	Weighted evaluation		
Curriculum vitae	0,80	CA) Scientific and technological, cultural or artistic production in the last five years, considered most relevant by the candidate. The content of the scientific output is more relevant than publication metrics or the publishing entity (65%)	0,55	60	33,00	100	55,00	44,00	
		CB) Applied or practice-based research activities developed in the last five years and considered by the candidate to be most impactful (20%)	0,20	60	12,00	100	20,00	16,00	
		CC) Extension and dissemination activities developed in the last five years, particularly in the context of promoting scientific culture and practices, considered most relevant by the candidate (4%)	0,04	60	2,40	100	4,00	2,80	
		CD) Management activities of science, technology, and innovation programs, or experience in observing, monitoring, and evaluating the scientific and technological system or higher education in Portugal or abroad (1%)	0,01	40	0,40	100	1,00	0,50	
		0,80		Subtotal:	47,80	Subtotal:	90,00	Subtotal:	63,30
Motivation and Capacity for Innovation	0,20	MA) Coerência na expressão das motivações para a posição, expondo a relevância do percurso científico e curricular para a posição e objetivos pessoais.	0,20	40	8,00	100	20,00	10,00	
		MB) Demonstração de alinhamento com os objetivos e valores do CCMAR, tendo por base a relevância do percurso científico e curricular.							
		0,20		Subtotal:	8,00	Subtotal:	20,00	Subtotal:	10,00
		Curricular and motivational evaluation		Total	55,80	Total	100,00	Total	73,30

General comment:

The call for this position had clear requests and the scope was very well set. My assessment of the candidates was based primarily on the fulfilment of that scope.

Candidate Barbara Bastos Horta e Costa

Outstanding Cv with absolute merit. It completely meets the requirements of the call. It presents well organized documents thoughtful set to correspond to scope of the call. Promising career development plan.

Candidate Neus Campany Llovet

Excellent Cv. Promising researcher. However, it's not adequate to cover all elements of the call (for e.g. in what regards to management or a more holistic approach to MPA s implementation processes). The career development plan is more focus on the pursuit of the researcher ongoing subjects than those set by the call.

Candidate Mohammadreza Mirzaei

Interesting Cv but not adequate for this call. It has interesting elements in fisheries and related subjects but not exactly on MPAs. No development plan is presented.

